



date, a list of seals by the initials of the producer, exporter, or agent, an index of illustrations, and a useful bibliography.

I have left the first section of the book (“Prologomena,” pp. 1–14) for last because, for those whose first concern is not to identify seals but to learn more about the history of trade between Russia and Britain, this is an invaluable short introduction with a good deal of new information or information not easily found elsewhere. Since the sixteenth century Russia was a major supplier of furs and raw or semiprocessed materials, especially for maritime purposes: “Riga” masts, timber, hemp, flax, pitch, tallow, and, later, ropes, sailcloth, grain, and iron. Early exports went through Archangel and Kholmogory, later St. Petersburg and Riga, and the other Baltic ports which came under Russian control in the eighteenth century. The trade in flax and hemp was particularly large—Britain was by far Russia’s biggest customer—and Sullivan surveys it expertly, with particular emphasis on the operation of the several kinds of *brak*, the inspection and quality-control system employed to grade the quality of exported products at the ports to prevent fraud and maintain standards. On this topic Sullivan’s book is now the first point of reference.

Overall this is an impeccably researched book, essential for seal collectors and museum curators with holdings in this field, who can perhaps afford it, and well worth consulting for anyone interested in Russian economic history of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

W. F. Ryan, Warburg Institute

Boeck, Brian J., Russell E. Martin, and Daniel Rowland, eds. *Dubitando: Studies in History and Culture in Honor of Donald Ostrowski*. Bloomington: Slavica, 2012. x + 504 pp. \$39.95 (paper). ISBN: 978-0-89357-404-8.

“*Dubitando enim ad inquisitionem venimus; inquirendo veritatem percipimus*” [For by doubting, we come to question; by questioning, we perceive truth]. All who have the privilege of knowing Don Ostrowski will readily understand why the editors of his Festschrift took this line from Abelard as their inspiration. A prolific and penetrating scholar, as well as an award-winning teacher at Harvard University and Extension School, Professor Ostrowski is best known for his incurable doubting, rigorous questioning, and tireless insistence on careful and accurate examination of primary sources. In their three tributes, the editors repeatedly emphasize those qualities that make Don a valued friend and respected academic: warmth, humility, honesty, interest in others, generosity, and perhaps above all critical thinking. *Dubitando* is an impressive and fitting tribute to his healthy skepticism and wide-ranging expertise in Russian-Mongol interactions, Church history, fontology, and several other fields (see his bibliography, pp. 11–23).

Almost by definition, a Festschrift is difficult to unify or summarize. Happily, all the authors have taken Ostrowski’s example and body of work seriously in order to produce a volume centered on challenging customary ways of thinking and pushing the boundaries of what can be learned from the sources. The bulk of the collection is divided into five sections: Rus’ and Eurasia; Rulers and Rulership; The Church and Religious Belief and Custom; Texts, Images, Contexts; and Land, People, and Society in Muscovy. I can offer in this space only brief and uneven treatment of the thirty fascinating and thoughtful articles, contributed mostly by leading American scholars. The order followed below is the same as that in *Dubitando*.



In the first essay, Christopher Atwood marshals an impressive array of evidence to overcome phonological difficulties with equating the ethnonyms *Hun* and *Xiōngnú*. His argumentation with regard to Indian intermediary forms may be correct; but it is a mistake to insist that “any form with a velar spirant [x] would become *kh-* in Greek” transliteration, especially if citing “Semitic *hēth*” as a related example (pp. 31–32, 43). Ancient Jewish Greek writings include multitudinous examples of *hēth* [x] dropping in Hellenic transcription instead of being rendered by *kh-*: *xannah* > *anna*, *xananyah* > *anania(s)*, *yitsxaq* > *isaak*, *mashiax* > *messias*, and so on (this regardless of speculative rough breathings; cf. p. 28n.7). Atwood may also discount too readily the possibility that an original syllable could merge with a Hellenized case ending (pp. 28, 31), as illustrated by some of the examples above. Still, these adjustments would actually make the article’s main contention easier. Ostrowski the “caterfly” (pp. 10, 12) and Socratic gadfly might simply urge never to be *too* sure of any particular philological or historical dogma.

Inés García de la Puente argues that archaeological reports of camels in pre-Mongol Rus' have been significantly exaggerated, with implications for interpretation of major trading routes. In the only non-English (Russian) article of the collection, Oleksii Tolochko uncovers Byzantine sources that likely influenced the Russian primary chronicler. Focusing on 911, but referring also to 987, he argues that accounts of personal missionizing and exhibition of relics on the part of the emperor stemmed from literary imitation of specific recorded precedents rather than from historical actuality. One wonders, however, if the two possibilities are entirely mutually exclusive. Susana Torres Prieto contends that modern genre theories of medieval Rus' literature distort the original contexts and intentions of writers and editors. Princes such as Aleksandr Nevskii could be “characterized simultaneously as a fierce warrior and a pious ruler” with no perceived contradiction (p. 74). Her conclusions are controversial for those who posit a marked distinction between “religious” and “secular” values and spheres of activity.

Lawrence Langer surveys what is known and thought about the flow of silver through the Mongol Empire, the Rus' lands, and Europe in the fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. His findings imply that northern Rus', especially Novgorod, was able to import enough silver to support a Mongol tribute of perhaps 5,000–10,000 rubles per year and that “Moscow acted as a kind of economic sponge,” profiting from the situation (p. 101). George Weickhardt explains how the Novgorod-Hansa trade, including such importation of silver, rested on a developing “triadic system of dispute resolution” that may have influenced Rus'/Russian law generally (p. 111). Bulat Rakhimzyanov takes for granted Muscovy’s integration into the system of steppe politics and offers an important comparison between its Tatar princely immigrants and those of Lithuania. He presents a persuasive argument regarding the higher legal and factual status of Tatars in Muscovy in contrast to Lithuania; however, due to the paucity of sources, some interpretations are speculative and open to debate.

Brian Boeck provocatively argues that a “cluster of shared characteristics” in Lyzlov’s *History of the Scythians* and (psuedo-)Kurbskii’s *History of the Grand Prince of Moscow* derive from a common, non-extant source (pp. 129–30). Boeck here challenges the simple traditional view that Lyzlov borrowed from Kurbskii (K); his monograph-in-progress will hopefully address the more nuanced possibility of a sixteenth-century K text transmitted with seventeenth-century marginalia and redaction (cf. pp. 129n.3, 136–38). Sean Pollock provides a useful overview of Russian-Caucasian *amanatstvo* (diplomatic hostage-taking). Emphasizing that little has been discovered about the lives of the *amanaty* (hostages), Pollock points to the career of Kazbulat Murza (Dmitrii Taganov) as evidence that



“diplomatic hostages could transcend their original calling as human sureties and aspire to play crucial, independent roles in Russia’s efforts to build its empire in Caucasia” (p. 140). Pollock correctly points to ancient Roman, Persian, and Indian precedents instead of accepting that *amanatstvo* had been “invented by Mongol and Turkic conquerors” (p. 142); yet the practice of taking royal hostages as guarantees against rebellion by subordinated tribes is also well attested considerably earlier, including in the Near East and in China (for example, on Assyrian *litu*: Stefan Zawadzki, “Hostages in Assyrian Royal Inscriptions,” *Immigration and Emigration Within the Ancient Near East* [1995]).

Elena Boeck entertainingly deconstructs two series of attempts (by Vysotskii and Nikitenko) to spot Rus’ princesses in the frescoes of Kiev’s St. Sophia Cathedral. She argues that national narratives and myth-making in the current Ukrainian political situation have unfortunately overridden sound critical inquiry. Yet her own brief suggestion of an intentionally ambiguous original must also be considered speculative and unproven, particularly as she has elsewhere remarked that “such polyvalence is extremely rare in both Rus’ and Byzantine contexts” (“Simulating the Hippodrome,” *Art Bulletin* 91:3 [2009]: 289). Michael Flier contends that the development of *Pokrov* (Mary’s Veil/Intercession/Protection) iconography and architecture was closely linked to perceptions of rulership and thereby came to represent Muscovite eschatological and world-salvific aspirations.

Charles Halperin skillfully explores the strengths and weaknesses of the late Ruslan Skrynnikov’s voluminous treatments of Ivan IV. Isolde Thyrêt continues her examination of how association of Muscovite royal woman with female saints bolstered their political authority over the course of the sixteenth century, a development that arguably came to fruition in the Time of Troubles of the early seventeenth century (see my *Orthodox Russia in Crisis*). Russell Martin traces the history of succession regulations in eighteenth-century Russia, contending that Peter I effectively “abolished the notion of the dynasty” (pp. 230, 242) by claiming the right to appoint any successor. Yet a similar claim had arguably been advanced already in the late fifteenth century by Ivan III (cf. p. 239n.34). Martin frames the post-Petrine situation in East-West terms: “In Russia in the eighteenth century, the legal profession had not yet fully moved from kolpak and kaftan to wig and robe” (p. 242). He concludes somewhat controversially that Paul I “refounded” the Romanov dynasty by making its succession dependent on law.

Using the tools of formal logic, David Goldfrank elucidates the underlying structure of some of Iosif Volotskii’s “refutative enthymemes” (p. 250). This not only reveals Volotskii’s skill as a rhetorician—the very same techniques are used by some authors of *Dubitando*—but may also help explain other patterns within Muscovite theological thought. Further detailed study could perhaps determine by which particular indirect path Volotskii acquired some familiarity with essentially Aristotelian logic. Ironically but not unusually for an “anti-Jewish” polemicist, his knowledge may have come via Jewish mediation (whether ancient or medieval). David Miller traces the career of Elder Varsunofii of Trinity-Sergius, once again demonstrating the intricately close connections among sanctity, wealth, and political power in Muscovy. Valerie Kivelson draws parallels between widespread early modern Western images of erotic witchcraft on the one hand, and a possible connection between rape and love spells in a Russian trial record of 1688 on the other. Kivelson’s artful wringing of the sources to construct her argument is impressive, but as is so often the case, the relative lack of evidence on the Russian side leaves room for doubt. In a somewhat mystical article, Nickolas Lupinin explores prayer apparently from the perspective of an Orthodox Christian believer and practitioner. Though readers will have a wide range of



views on this topic, such a treatment reminds all scholars of the necessity to “enter into” the mindset of historical subjects, rather than merely analyzing “from the outside.”

William Veder argues for a “massive Glagolitic input into early Russian letters” (p. 334), providing details regarding transcription of the *Scete Paterikon* and suggestions regarding other texts and further research. Francis Butler offers an interlinear collation and paradosis of the intriguing Legend of Gorislava (from the so-called Suzdalian Chronicle) in the style of Ostrowski’s edition of *Povest’ vremennykh let*. Daniel Rowland discusses the Dormition Cathedral in Sviiazhsk (near Kazan) as an historical source, offering that its original murals represented an attempt to make Christianity attractive to newly conquered Muslim peoples. By focusing on Creation and Mary, Orthodox designers highlighted themes also familiar within Islam. This is certainly suggestive, though not conclusive, evidence. Chester Dunning describes and transcribes a “quirky” (p. 378) understudied eyewitness account of the horrific Time of Troubles. Its author, identified by Dunning as James Freese, was born in Russia of mixed English-Russian parentage. It is difficult to know what credence to give Freese’s later report of events observed in his first decade of life; but his life story and writings illustrate much about the nature of connections between early modern England and Russia.

Daniel Kaiser’s case study of confessional registers from a Tula parish in the late eighteenth century shows that, although “caution is certainly warranted” due to the admitted presence of often motivated errors (p. 397), such sources can sometimes yield key insights into patterns of religious life among men and women of both high and low rank. In her aptly named “Pictures at an Execution,” Nancy Shields Kollmann analyzes the anonymous engraving of the *strel'tsy* massacres (1698) that appeared with Johann-Georg Korb’s eyewitness account. Kollmann’s interest seems to lie primarily in the depiction’s (limited) value as an historical source, but along the way she reveals the depth and appeal of this image as art and as communication, with particular regard for its treatment of time and detail. Somewhat unexpectedly for a collection of this nature, Fred Spier describes his personal quest to understand the remarkable Apollo 8 Earthrise photograph (1968). Apparently it was not possible to include this photo in the gallery of forty-one high-quality images in the middle of the book, but digital versions are readily available online.

Ann Kleimola surveys the positive and negative sides of psychological, cultural, religious, legal, and visual images of dogs in pre-seventeenth-century Rus'. She asserts a higher evaluation of canines than might appear at first blush. However, one should be careful not to misread Richard Hellie’s *The Economy and Material Culture of Russia* as “exhaustive” (p. 428); it unquestionably represents an extraordinary contribution, but is “based almost exclusively on published sources” (Hellie, p. 650). I have found that archival sources sometimes yield a far more detailed and different picture of prices (“Black Monks and White Gold,” *Russian History* 37 [2010]: 238–49). Building on the central themes of Ostrowski’s *Muscovy and the Mongols*, and drawing on recent advances in Central Asian steppe history, C. K. Woodworth contends that “we are now in a position to make the argument that the *majority* of the underlying structure of the Muscovite government and its practices was learned from the Mongol-Turkic steppe tradition writ large, and from the Chingizid successor states in particular” (p. 447; my emphasis). Identifying ten specific features of a “clan-based state” on the Mongol-Turkic pattern, Woodworth asserts that Muscovy represented “an attenuated but still significant form” of just such a tribal-imperial hybrid polity (pp. 452, 459). Her conclusions merit discussion, as they are obviously highly



significant within the context of Russian historiography and join a long stream of discourse on the topic.

Janet Martin weighs in on the puzzling question of whether *pomest'e* land grants carried an obligation of service. She concludes, *pace* Ostrowski, that they did, but attempts to reconcile this view with Ostrowski's data by claiming that service did not always entail *pomest'e*. Carol Stevens explains on the basis of a specific rape trial how the Petrine military courts, while expanding their role in seemingly civilian life, took women's testimony quite seriously and coincidentally "helped to erode the older balance between punishment of offender and compensation for the victim" (p. 485). In the final article of the collection, John LeDonne brings the reader into the "murky world of Russian legislative politics" of the 1820s. Describing competing interpretations of Cossack land rights in the upper echelons of government, as well as a "dialogue of the deaf" between center and periphery (p. 500), LeDonne contends that conflict between the "political" and "technocratic" elites is what "open[ed] the way to the eventual disintegration of the imperial government" (pp. 501–502).

Taken as a whole, *Dubitando* is an exceptionally rich and valuable compendium illustrating the current state of research on a wide variety of themes related to Kievan and Muscovite history. I personally found it stimulating for several directions of my own research. The Festschrift employs numerous scripts in a professional manner and is mostly very well-edited; I noticed only some minor points of punctuation, spelling, and wording. The disparate materials and manifold details of investigation collectively justify and continue the process of attempting to define the precise position of Rus' and Russia within the interlocking worlds of the steppe, Scandinavia, Byzantium, and the West. However, this "big picture" perspective is not explicit in the volume; each reader must discern how to integrate the multitudinous minutiae. Many of the assertions in this collection will undoubtedly meet with criticism and debate. Therein lies its greatest utility for scholars and strongest endorsement of Don Ostrowski, the doubter, questioner, and truth-seeker, as we await his next breakthrough.

Isaiah Gruber, Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Clements, Barbara Evans. *A History of Women in Russia: From Earliest Times to the Present*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2012. xv + 386 pp. \$28.00 (paper). ISBN 978-0-253-00101-6.

Barbara Clements's excellent book broadens our vision of Russian politics, economics, and society, incorporating the latest scholarship to demonstrate women's centrality to the overall picture. Starting with Kievan Rus' and ending in 2011, Clements's vivid narrative reveals how women were anything but peripheral to historical developments. At the same time she keeps readers apprised of where Russia stood in comparison to the West, challenging notions of backwardness and exceptionalism. Throughout the work she examines how geographic and cultural factors affected subjects from all social classes in the expanding empire—for better and for worse. Enlivening her analysis are primary sources and vignettes about individual women whose lives and contributions belie earlier stories of relentless patriarchal oppression.

The Russian Review

An American Quarterly Devoted to Russia Past and Present

VOLUME 72/NUMBER 3

JULY 2013

Contributors to This Issue	ii
The Thermodynamics of Desire in Turgenev's <i>Notes of a Hunter</i>	365
Thomas Newlin	
Andrei Bitov's <i>Pushkin House</i> : A Critical Analysis of the Late Soviet Hero	390
Ann Komaromi	
Talking Rocks in the Irkutsk Museum: Networks of Science in Late Imperial Siberia	409
Julia Fein	
The Komsomol's Village Vanguard: Youth and Politics in the NEP Countryside	427
Isabel Tirado	
Russian Empire of Pop: Post-Soviet Nostalgia and Soviet Retro at the "New Wave" Competition	447
Kevin M. F. Platt	
Serializing National Cohesion: Channel 1's "Shkola" and the Contradictions of Post-Soviet "Consensus Management"	470
Stephen Hutchings	

BOOK REVIEWS

LITERATURE AND FINE ARTS

Priscilla Hunt and Svitlana Kobets *Holy Foolishness in Russia: New Perspectives*
Christopher D. L. Johnson 492

Mikhail Chulkov, Matvei Komarov, and Nikolai Karamzin *Three Russian Tales of the Eighteenth Century: The Comely Cook, Vanka Kain, and "Poor Liza"* Translated by David Gasperetti
Priscilla Hunt 493

Anna Schur *Wages of Evil: Dostoevsky and Punishment*
Aaron Weinacht 495

Radislav Lapushin *"Dew on the Grass": The Poetics of Inbetweenness in Chekhov*
Katherine Tiernan O'Connor 497

Paul du Quenoy *Stage Fright: Politics and the Performing Arts in Late Imperial Russia*
J. Douglas Clayton 499

Christina Ezrahi *Swans of the Kremlin: Ballet and Power in Soviet Russia*
Simon Morrison 500

Rachel S. Platonov *Singing the Self: Guitar Poetry, Community, and Identity in the Post-Stalin Period*
Karen Ryan 501

Marina Tsvetaeva *Phaedra: A Drama in Verse, with New Year's Letter and Other Long Poems*. Translated by Angela Livingstone
Alyssa Dinega Gillespie 502

HISTORY

John Sullivan *Russian Cloth Seals in Britain: Trade, Textiles and Origins*
W. F. Ryan 504

Brian J. Boeck, Russell E. Martin, and Daniel Rowland, eds. *Dubitando: Studies in History and Culture in Honor of Donald Ostrowski*
Isaiah Gruber 505

Barbara Evans Clements *A History of Women in Russia: From Earliest Times to the Present*
Laurie Bernstein 509

Serhii Plokyh, ed. *Poltava 1709: The Battle and the Myth*
Ernest A. Zitser 511

Anton A. Fedyashin *Liberals under Autocracy: Modernization and Civil Society in Russia, 1866–1904*
Joseph C. Bradley 512

Natal'ia Selunskaiia and Rolf Torstendahl *The Birth of Democratic Culture in Late Imperial Russia: Reforms and Elections to the First Two National Legislatures, 1905–1907*
Michael Melançon 514

Scott Ury *Barricades and Banners: The Revolution of 1905 and the Transformation of Warsaw Jewry*
Antony Polonsky 515

Svetlana Gorshenina *Asie centrale: L'invention des frontières et l'héritage russo-soviétique*
Ernest Tucker 517

- Liudmila Novikova** *Provintsial'naia "kontrrevoliutsiia": Beloe dvizhenie i Grazhdanskaia voina na russkom Severe, 1917–1920*
Erik C. Landis 518
- Attila Seres** *Hungarian-Soviet Economic Relations, 1920–1941* Translated by Thomas, J. and Helen D. DeKornfeld
Carl H. McMillan 520
- Aleksandr Gogun** *Stalinskie kommandos: Ukrainskie partizanske formirovaniia, 1914–1944*
Alexander Statiev 521
- O. V. Budnitskii and G. S. Zelenina, comps. and eds.** *"Svershilos': Prishli nemtsy!" Ideinyi kollaboratsionizm v SSSR v period Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny*
Rebecca Manley 523
- Michael David-Fox, Peter Holquist, and Alexander M. Martin, eds.** *Fascination and Enmity: Russia and Germany as Entangled Histories, 1914–1945*
Evan Mawdsley 524
- Niklas Zetterling and Andreas Frankson** *The Drive on Moscow 1941: Operation Taifun and Germany's First Great Crisis in World War II*
Edward J. Davies 526
- Maike Lehmann** *Eine sowjetische Nation: Nationale Sozialismusinterpretationen in Armenien seit 1945*
Gerhard Simon 527
- Dariusz Tołczyk** *Gulag w oczach Zachodu*
Bożena Karwowska 528
- I. V. Semenenko-Basin** *Sviatost' v Russkoi pravoslavnoi kul'ture XX veka: Istoriia personifikatsii*
Robert H. Greene 529
- Alexander Etkind and Rory Finnin, et al.** *Remembering Katyn*
Tuomas Forsberg 531
- SOCIAL SCIENCES, CONTEMPORARY RUSSIA, AND OTHER
- Tatiana Argounova-Low** *The Politics of Nationalism in the Republic of Sakha (Northwestern Siberia) 1900–2000*
Marjorie Mandelstam Balzer 532
- Thane Gustafson** *Wheel of Fortune: The Battle for Oil and Power in Russia*
Li-Chen Sim 533
- Fiona Hill and Clifford G. Gaddy** *Mr. Putin: Operative in the Kremlin*
Richard Sakwa 535
- Philipp Casula** *Hegemonie und Populismus in Putins Russland: Eine Analyse des russischen politischen Diskurses*
Martin Müller 536
- Anna Fournier** *Forging Rights in a New Democracy: Ukrainian Students between Freedom and Justice*
Alexandra Hrycak 537
- Gerald M. Easter** *Capital, Coercion, and Postcommunist States*
Hilary Appel 538
- Christer Pursiainen, ed.** *At the Crossroads of Post-Communist Modernization: Russia and China in Comparative Perspective*
Cheng Chen 539

Hilary Appel <i>Tax Politics in Eastern Europe: Globalization, Regional Integration, and the Democratic Compromise</i> Rachel A. Epstein	541	Alicja Curanović <i>The Religious Factor in Russia's Foreign Policy</i> Christopher Marsh	543
Maria Raquel Freire and Roger E. Kanet, eds. <i>Russia and Its Near Neighbours: Identity, Interests and Foreign Policy</i> Boris Barkanov	542	Vera Zvereva <i>Setevye razgovory: Kul'turnye kommunikatsii v Runete</i> Olga Kim	544
Publications Received			546